



EVALUATION SCORING MATRIX SUMMARY
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL 26-021
Benefits Advisor and Employee Benefits Consultant

Evaluation Criteria	Points Per Evaluator	Total Points Allowed	CBIZ Benefits and Insurance	Higginbotham	GBS Benefits Inc	Hub International	McGriff Mark MMA
Service Model and Responsiveness	30	90	66	78	57	81	61
Experience and Qualifications	30	90	71	62	66	82	69
Technical Approach and Innovation	25	75	64	54	59	63	51
Pricing and Fees (lowest bid/other bid * points value of price)	15	45	9	18	45	39	24
Total	100	300	210	212	227	265	205

Company Totals	Rankings	Totals
Hub International	1	265
GBS Benefits Inc	2	227
Higginbotham	3	212
CBIZ Benefits and Insurance	4	210
McGriff Mark MMA	5	205

Copy cost sheet here and extend to add all vendors

CBIZ Benefits and Insurance Services, Inc.		
Description of Service	Annual Cost Per Service	Notes for Service Provided
Strategic Benefits Consulting	\$77,088	Annual projections and modeling, rate adequacy and funding reviews, annual benchmarking, support for executive briefing and presentations, etc..
Vendor Management	\$66,576	Day to Day claims/service issues resolution and escalation as needed. Premium and Enrollment audits to ensure accuracy as well as annual contract/SBC reviews
Stop Loss Consulting and Procurement	\$42,048	Annual Marketing, Negotiation and Implementation as well as annual servicing and financial projections
Compliance and Regulatory Guidance	\$52,560	Annual Marketing, Negotiation and Implementation as well as annual servicing and financial projections
Any Fees added on that will included on the Total annual cost	\$42,048	Benefits Administration Platform, COBRA Administration, Call Center Services
Total Annual Cost for All Services Provided		\$280,320

Higginbotham		
Description of Service	Annual Cost Per Service	Notes for Service Provided
Strategic Benefits Consulting	Included	HPS is compensated by the insurance carriers and receive standard industry commissions.
Vendor Management	Included	
Stop Loss Consulting and Procurement	Included	
Compliance and Regulatory Guidance	Included	
Any Fees added on that will included on the Total annual cost	Included	
Total Annual Cost for All Services Provided		\$140,000

GBS Benefits, INC		
Description of Service	Annual Cost Per Service	Notes for Service Provided
Strategic Benefits Consulting	\$40,000	
Vendor Management	included	
Stop Loss Consulting and Procurement	\$19,000	Estimated Cost due to standard commission
Compliance and Regulatory Guidance	included	
Any Fees added on that will included on the Total annual cost	varies if selected	
Total Annual Cost for All Services Provided		\$59,000

Hub International		
Description of Service	Annual Cost Per Service	Notes for Service Provided
Strategic Benefits Consulting	\$69,450	Our fee is guaranteed for 2-years with a 5% increase year 3, no increase renewal options for year 4 and year 5.
Vendor Management	included	
Stop Loss Consulting and Procurement	included	
Compliance and Regulatory Guidance	included	
Any Fees added on that will included on the Total annual cost	varies if selected	
Total Annual Cost for All Services Provided		\$69,450

McGriff Mark MMA		
Description of Service	Annual Cost Per Service	Notes for Service Provided
Strategic Benefits Consulting	\$105,000	
Vendor Management	included	
Stop Loss Consulting and Procurement	included	
Compliance and Regulatory Guidance	included	
Any Fees added on that will included on the Total annual cost	varies if selected	
Total Annual Cost for All Services Provided		\$105,000

Vendor Name	CBIZ Benefits and Insurance	Higginbotham	GBS Benefits Inc	Hub International	McGriff Mark MMA
Proposer's Price	\$280,320	\$140,000	\$59,000	\$69,450	\$105,000
Point Value for Cost of Services (lowest bid/other bid * points value of price)	3	6	15	13	8

James Brumm	CBIZ Benefits and Insurance	Higginbotham	GBS Benefits Inc	Hub International	McGriff Mark MMA
Service Model and Responsiveness	20	20	20	25	20
Experience and Qualifications	25	10	25	30	25
Technical Approach and Innovation	20	10	25	20	20
Pricing and Fees (from Cost Analysis)	3	6	15	13	8
Total	68	46	85	88	73

**Be sure to update to reflect specific evaluation criteria for each RFP

Karissa Steer	CBIZ Benefits and Insurance	Higginbotham	GBS Benefits Inc	Hub International	McGriff Mark MMA
Service Model and Responsiveness	19	30	12	30	16
Experience and Qualifications	19	24	15	26	18
Technical Approach and Innovation	21	21	12	21	9
Pricing and Fees (from Cost Analysis)	3	6	15	13	8
Total	62	81	54	90	51

Stephanie Burnitt	CBIZ Benefits and Insurance	Higginbotham	GBS Benefits Inc	Hub International	McGriff Mark MMA
Service Model and Responsiveness	27	28	25	26	25
Experience and Qualifications	27	28	26	26	26
Technical Approach and Innovation	23	23	22	22	22
Pricing and Fees (from Cost Analysis)	3	6	15	13	8
Total	80	85	88	87	81